How ❤s Change Minds:

Social Media Endorsements and Policy Preferences*

Supplementary Materials – US Experiment

Pierluigi Conzo†ⓡ Laura K. Taylor‡ⓡ Juan S. Morales§ⓡ Margaret Samahita¶ⓡ Andrea Gallice||

November 16, 2020

*Authors' order has been randomized using the AEA Author Randomization Tool (reference: eTjbU-ATa_zKY), denoted by ⓡ.

†Department of Economics and Statistics 'S. Cognetti de Martiis', University of Turin and Collegio Carlo Alberto

‡School of Psychology, University College Dublin

§Collegio Carlo Alberto and Department of Economic and Social Sciences and Mathematics-Statistics (ESOMAS), University of Turin

¶School of Economics, University College Dublin

||Department of Economic and Social Sciences and Mathematics-Statistics (ESOMAS), University of Turin and Collegio Carlo Alberto

This document contains analyses pre-registered at https://www.socialscienceregistry.org/trials/6254. It is structured into the following subsections:

- Section 1: Main effects
  - Section 1.1: for the whole sample
  - Section 1.2: for 4 subgroups {active social media users, non-active social media users}×{non-primed, primed}
  - Section 1.3: this section presents results of priming in the US sample and as such shows the 4 subgroups of non-primed subjects, primed subjects, active social media users and non-active social media users separately
- Section 2: Heterogeneous treatment effects
  - Section 2.1: for the whole sample
  - Section 2.2: for 4 subgroups {active social media users, non-active social media users}×{non-primed, primed}
- Section 3: Mediation analysis
  - Section 3.1: for the whole sample
  - Section 3.2: for 4 subgroups {active social media users, non-active social media users}×{non-primed, primed}

1 Main effects

1.1 Pooled sample

We regress the outcome variable $PostAttitudes_i$, the first principal component of the post-treatment attitude questions, on a treatment indicator that takes value 1 if subject i receives the treatment.

$$PostAttitudes_i = \alpha + \beta_1 ProEconTreatment_i + \beta_2 ProHealthTreatment_i + \delta PreAttitudes_i + \varepsilon_i$$

where ε_i is an individual-specific error term and $PreAttitudes_i$ is the variable measuring attitudes before the treatment.[1] We present results using the first principal component of the responses to the pre-treatment attitude questions (denoted "PC1" in Table 1). As it turns out, this measure places a low weight on one question that has a high correlation with the post-treatment attitude questions while placing a high weight on other less-correlated questions. Therefore, we also present results controlling for all the pre-attitude questions separately ("Qs"). In some specification(s) we use a vector of controls $\mathbf{X_i}$ including age, gender, region, education, income and political leaning, which may increase the precision of our estimates (but should be orthogonal to our treatment since it is randomized). In all specifications we use robust standard errors.

Our hypotheses indicate that $\beta_1 > 0$ and $\beta_2 < 0$. Treatment effect is then defined as $\beta = (\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$. We test the null hypothesis that $\beta_1 = \beta_2$.

[1] We additionally pre-registered an alternative definition of treatment effect as the absolute distance moved from Pre- to PostAttitudes, multiplied by -1 if the subject moves away from the treatment direction. However, by construction this measure will always be positive for the control condition, thus artificially inflating a negative treatment effect.

Table 1: Main treatment effects

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Treatment Econ	-0.017	-0.013	0.048	0.048
	(0.059)	(0.058)	(0.049)	(0.049)
Treatment Health	-0.036	-0.017	0.018	0.023
	(0.058)	(0.059)	(0.048)	(0.048)
TE: $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$	0.009	0.002	0.015	0.012
N	1519	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.138	0.151	0.441	0.445
Pre-attitudes	Qs	Qs	Qs	Qs
Other controls	No	Yes	No	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. TE equals the average treatment effect of the pro-economy and pro-health treatments, calculated as $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$. Pre-attitude is defined as either PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions, or Qs, the pre-treatment policy questions entered separately. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

1.2 Subgroup analyses

We next repeat the above regression for the group of:

- Table 2: active and non-active social media users, non-primed
- Table 3: active and non-active social media users, primed

Active social media users are defined to be those who spend more than one hour daily on Facebook or Twitter (combined). Primed individuals are those exposed to an additional *attention prime* prior to the main treatment. Subjects are shown a neutral tweet followed by three questions about the content, number of likes, and timing of this tweet.

As seen in Table 2 columns 3-4, within the sample analysed in the main text (active social media users, non-primed), the treatment has a significant effect when controlling for all the pre-treatment attitude questions separately. Using the first principal component yields a similar treatment effect coefficient, but this is not significant. As shown in Tables 2 and 3, we do not find treatment effect for the non-active social media users. In the primed group, the treatment has a marginally significant negative effect (Table 3, column 1) though this effect disappears when other controls are included.

Table 2: Main treatment effects for individuals in non-primed group

	Active SM users				Non-active SM users			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.165	0.181	0.219	0.254*	0.012	0.020	0.049	0.050
	(0.184)	(0.184)	(0.152)	(0.153)	(0.091)	(0.090)	(0.078)	(0.078)
Treatment Health	-0.075	-0.066	-0.063	-0.052	0.041	0.039	0.078	0.069
	(0.163)	(0.160)	(0.140)	(0.141)	(0.094)	(0.094)	(0.078)	(0.079)
TE: $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$	0.120	0.124	0.141**	0.153**	-0.014	-0.009	-0.015	-0.009
N	177	177	177	177	602	602	602	602
R-sq	0.021	0.068	0.404	0.435	0.235	0.266	0.481	0.490
Pre-attitudes	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs
Other controls	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. TE equals the average treatment effect of the pro-economy and pro-health treatments, calculated as $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$. Pre-attitude is defined as either PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions, or Qs, the pre-treatment policy questions entered separately. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 3: Main treatment effects for primed group

	Active SM users				Non-active SM users			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.016	-0.025	0.040	0.074	-0.063	-0.053	-0.002	-0.006
	(0.153)	(0.151)	(0.127)	(0.123)	(0.087)	(0.089)	(0.077)	(0.078)
Treatment Health	0.252	0.216	0.126	0.121	-0.114	-0.084	-0.019	-0.018
	(0.167)	(0.167)	(0.133)	(0.130)	(0.086)	(0.087)	(0.073)	(0.073)
TE: $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$	-0.134*	-0.120	-0.043	-0.023	0.025	0.015	0.008	0.006
N	148	148	148	148	592	592	592	592
R-sq	0.042	0.121	0.433	0.483	0.215	0.223	0.437	0.440
Pre-attitudes	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs
Other controls	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. TE equals the average treatment effect of the pro-economy and pro-health treatments, calculated as $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$. Pre-attitude is defined as either PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions, or Qs, the pre-treatment policy questions entered separately. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

1.3 Priming

We next repeat the above regression for the group of subjects who are:

- Table 4: not primed and primed separately
- Table 5: active and non-active social media users separately

We do not find main effects in the non-primed or primed group when analysed separately (Table 4). In Table 5 we confirm that our main effect, that endorsements change the attitude of social media users, is robust to including the primed group (column 4) though the result is marginally significant.

Table 4: Main treatment effects

	Primed				Non-primed			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.014	0.020	0.080	0.082	-0.050	-0.059	0.014	-0.000
	(0.085)	(0.084)	(0.069)	(0.070)	(0.081)	(0.081)	(0.068)	(0.068)
Treatment Health	-0.013	-0.003	0.033	0.034	-0.060	-0.048	-0.000	-0.007
	(0.085)	(0.085)	(0.068)	(0.069)	(0.080)	(0.081)	(0.066)	(0.066)
TE: $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$	0.014	0.011	0.024	0.024	0.005	-0.006	0.007	0.003
N	779	779	779	779	740	740	740	740
R-sq	0.134	0.154	0.460	0.466	0.143	0.158	0.424	0.429
Pre-attitudes	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs
Other controls	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. TE equals the average treatment effect of the pro-economy and pro-health treatments, calculated as $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$. Pre-attitude is defined as either PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions, or Qs, the pre-treatment policy questions entered separately. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 5: Main treatment effects

	Active SM users				Non-active SM users			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.090	0.111	0.136	0.180*	-0.026	-0.009	0.025	0.031
	(0.123)	(0.121)	(0.100)	(0.099)	(0.063)	(0.063)	(0.055)	(0.055)
Treatment Health	0.078	0.090	0.013	0.028	-0.035	-0.011	0.032	0.037
	(0.117)	(0.116)	(0.096)	(0.094)	(0.064)	(0.064)	(0.054)	(0.053)
TE: $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$	0.006	0.011	0.061	0.076*	0.005	0.001	-0.004	-0.003
N	325	325	325	325	1194	1194	1194	1194
R-sq	0.015	0.057	0.405	0.434	0.223	0.239	0.458	0.462
Pre-attitudes	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs	PC1	PC1	Qs	Qs
Other controls	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. TE equals the average treatment effect of the pro-economy and pro-health treatments, calculated as $(\beta_1 - \beta_2)/2$. Pre-attitude is defined as either PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions, or Qs, the pre-treatment policy questions entered separately. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

2 Heterogeneous treatment effects

2.1 Pooled sample

In addition, we test for heterogeneous effects along various dimensions by interacting the treatment dummy as described above with different variables:

$$\begin{aligned} PostAttitudes_i = \alpha &+ \beta_1 ProEconTreatment_i + \beta_2 ProHealthTreatment_i \\ &+ \theta_1 ProEconTreatment_i \times HetVar_i \\ &+ \theta_2 ProHealthTreatment_i \times HetVar_i \\ &+ \delta_1 PreAttitudes_i + \delta_2 HetVar_i + \varepsilon_i \end{aligned}$$

where $HetVar_i$ is the heterogeneity dimension explored.

In each of the following tables, we analyse heterogeneity for the pre-registered variables in the full sample. The *HetVar* variables are defined below.

- Table 6: social media use, media consumption and trust in institutions
  - *ActiveSMuser:* an indicator equal to 1 if the individual spends more than one hour daily on Facebook or Twitter (combined)
  - *MediaFreq:* How active on social media (including browsing, liking and commenting) are you yourself? (0-100)
  - *FbUse:* How much time per day do you spend on Facebook? 0 "never/no account", 1 "less than 30 minutes", 2 "from 30 minutes to 1 hour", 3 "more than 1 hour"
  - *TwUse:* How much time per day do you spend on Twitter? 0 "never/no account", 1 "less than 30 minutes", 2 "from 30 minutes to 1 hour", 3 "more than 1 hour"
  - *MediaUse:* How much time per day do you spend watching, reading or listening to news about politics and current affairs? 0 "never/no account", 1 "less than 30 minutes", 2 "from 30 minutes to 1 hour", 3 "more than 1 hour"
  - *SMnews:* an indicator equal to 1 if the individual lists social media as a source for news about politics and current affairs
  - *TrustMedia:* trust in the media, 0 "no trust at all", 1 "do not trust very much", 2 "trust somewhat", 3 "trust completely"

- *TrustGovt:* trust in the national government, 0 "no trust at all", 1 "do not trust very much", 2 "trust somewhat", 3 "trust completely"

- Table 7: attention and malleability
  - *Primed:* an indicator equal to 1 if the individual is in the primed treatment
  - *ManipCheck:* an indicator equal to 1 if the more popular policy perceived from tweets coincides with treatment
  - *FirstSignalEcon:* an indicator equal to 1 if the first tweet shown is pro-economy
  - *LastSignalEcon:* an indicator equal to 1 if the last tweet shown is pro-economy
  - *InfluenceOnSM:* How much does public support of a given policy on social media influence your own support of that policy? 1 "not at all" – 7 "completely" (standardised)
  - *InfluenceOffSM:* How much does public support of a given policy outside social media influence your own support of that policy? 1 "not at all" – 7 "completely" (standardised)
  - *RTC:* Resistance to change scale (Oreg, 2003) (standardised)

- Table 8: pre-treatment attitude and network
  - *PreAttitudes:* first principal component of the responses to the pre-treatment attitude questions (standardised)
  - *SingleQ:* response to pre-Attitude question best correlated with PostAttitude (standardised)[2]
  - *Confidence:* confidence in responses to the pre-treatment attitude questions (standardied)
  - *PolPosition:* self-reported position on left (0) – right (10) scale (standardised)
  - *Rightwing:* an indicator equal to 1 if the individual voted for the Republican party in the last election
  - *EconNetwork:* an indicator equal to 1 if the pro-economy view has more support in subject's social network
  - *DiscOnSM:* How often do you discuss policy issues with your friends or family members on social media? 0 "never" 1 "rarely" 2 "sometimes" 3 "often" 4 "always"

[2]This is an alternative measure of PreAttitudes, as described in the main text.

- *DiscOffSM:* How often do you discuss policy issues with your friends or family members outside social media? 0 "never" 1 "rarely" 2 "sometimes" 3 "often" 4 "always"

- Table 9: Covid experience and social preferences (Falk et al., 2018)
  - *CovEssential:* an indicator equal to 1 if the subject is employed as an essential worker
  - *CovJob:* Overall, how has your employment been affected since the outbreak of the pandemic? 0 "no negative effect" 1 "affected a little eg having to work from home, but no financial impact" 2 "affected a lot eg number of hours have gone down or taken a pay cut" 3 "I have been furloughed or lost my job"
  - *CovWorry:* How worried are you about yourself or a family member contracting COVID-19? 0 "not worried at all" – 10 "extremely worried" (standardised)
  - *CovComplState:* To what extent have you complied the social-distancing requirements in your state? 0 "not at all" – 10 "completely" (standardised)
  - *CovComplGuidelines:* To what extent have you complied the public health guidelines (eg. wearing face coverings, practicing hand hygiene, not touching your face)? 0 "not at all" – 10 "completely" (standardised)
  - *Altruism:* How willing are you to give to good causes without expecting anything in return? 0 "completely unwilling to do so" – 10 "very willing to do so" (standardised)
  - *Risk:* Please tell us, in general, how willing or unwilling you are to take risks. 0 "completely unwilling to take risks" – 10 "very willing to take risks" (standardised)
  - *Trust:* Generally speaking, would you say that most people can be trusted or that you can't be too careful in dealing with people? 0 "you can't be too careful" – 10 "most people can be trusted" (standardised)

- Table 10: Demographics
  - *Age:* subject's age in years
  - *Male:* an indicator equal to 1 if the subject is male

- *Education:* an indicator equal to 1 if the subject has completed at least a 2 year college degree
- *Income:* the log of the midpoint of the interval specified by the subject
- *Northeast:* an indicator equal to 1 if the subject's region is USA Northeast
- *Midwest:* an indicator equal to 1 if the subject's region is USA Midwest
- *South:* an indicator equal to 1 if the subject's region is USA South
- *West:* an indicator equal to 1 if the subject's region is USA West

Confirming our findings in the main text, we find that the treatment effect is larger for those correctly answering the manipulation check (see Table 7, column 2).

Table 6: Social media use, media consumption and trust in institutions

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.017	-0.040	-0.052	0.007	-0.158	0.048	0.065	0.025
	(0.063)	(0.088)	(0.085)	(0.067)	(0.131)	(0.066)	(0.102)	(0.103)
Treatment Health	-0.018	-0.030	0.007	-0.010	0.161	-0.024	0.114	0.051
	(0.064)	(0.092)	(0.085)	(0.070)	(0.125)	(0.066)	(0.108)	(0.106)
HetVar	-0.539***	-0.008***	-0.164***	-0.267***	-0.206***	-0.193*	-0.361***	-0.257***
	(0.099)	(0.001)	(0.041)	(0.043)	(0.044)	(0.099)	(0.047)	(0.052)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.066	0.000	0.039	-0.023	0.085	-0.268**	-0.067	-0.046
	(0.144)	(0.002)	(0.060)	(0.059)	(0.063)	(0.132)	(0.063)	(0.072)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.064	0.000	-0.025	0.018	-0.097	-0.015	-0.093	-0.045
	(0.137)	(0.002)	(0.059)	(0.058)	(0.059)	(0.137)	(0.063)	(0.071)
N	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.191	0.199	0.176	0.205	0.198	0.168	0.288	0.205
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: ActiveSMuser, MediaFreq, FbUse, TwUse, MediaUse, SMnews, TrustMedia, TrustGovt. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 7: Attention and malleability

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Treatment Econ	0.023	-0.112	-0.013	-0.063	-0.048	-0.043	-0.025
	(0.084)	(0.068)	(0.084)	(0.081)	(0.054)	(0.055)	(0.057)
Treatment Health	0.003	0.082	-0.071	0.013	-0.020	-0.033	-0.044
	(0.085)	(0.070)	(0.082)	(0.081)	(0.055)	(0.055)	(0.057)
HetVar	0.022	-0.036	0.059	-0.063	-0.355***	-0.319***	-0.234***
	(0.083)	(0.092)	(0.083)	(0.083)	(0.044)	(0.042)	(0.044)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.074	0.367***	-0.000	0.105	-0.051	-0.021	0.107*
	(0.117)	(0.130)	(0.118)	(0.116)	(0.060)	(0.063)	(0.064)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.041	-0.318**	0.096	-0.065	0.012	-0.021	-0.050
	(0.116)	(0.125)	(0.116)	(0.117)	(0.061)	(0.063)	(0.063)
N	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.152	0.167	0.154	0.153	0.259	0.250	0.198
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: Primed, ManipCheck, FirstSignalEcon, LastSignalEcon, InfluenceOnSM, InfluenceOffSM, RTC. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 8: Pre-treatment attitudes and network

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.012	0.033	-0.004	-0.012	-0.095	-0.041	0.002	-0.287**
	(0.058)	(0.048)	(0.057)	(0.058)	(0.070)	(0.062)	(0.082)	(0.135)
Treatment Health	-0.017	0.018	-0.027	-0.019	-0.047	-0.008	-0.089	-0.229
	(0.059)	(0.048)	(0.056)	(0.058)	(0.069)	(0.064)	(0.083)	(0.139)
HetVar	0.354***	0.531***	-0.228***	-0.143***	0.132	0.442***	-0.159***	-0.240***
	(0.051)	(0.044)	(0.046)	(0.051)	(0.091)	(0.106)	(0.034)	(0.040)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.027	0.076	-0.014	0.057	0.217*	0.068	-0.027	0.120**
	(0.070)	(0.056)	(0.067)	(0.069)	(0.124)	(0.146)	(0.048)	(0.058)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.035	0.082	-0.095	-0.013	0.073	-0.086	0.044	0.092
	(0.071)	(0.056)	(0.069)	(0.069)	(0.130)	(0.144)	(0.046)	(0.058)
N	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.152	0.436	0.217	0.163	0.153	0.181	0.189	0.190
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: PreAttitudes, SingleQ, Confidence, PolPosition, Rightwing, EconNetwork, DiscOnSM, DiscOffSM. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 9: Covid experience and social preferences

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.002	-0.003	-0.021	0.034	0.012	-0.034	-0.040	-0.023
	(0.066)	(0.071)	(0.049)	(0.050)	(0.050)	(0.056)	(0.057)	(0.057)
Treatment Health	0.014	0.044	-0.023	-0.035	-0.025	-0.046	-0.025	-0.014
	(0.066)	(0.073)	(0.047)	(0.049)	(0.049)	(0.056)	(0.056)	(0.056)
HetVar	0.047	-0.018	-0.560***	-0.514***	-0.502***	-0.222***	-0.184***	-0.159***
	(0.095)	(0.045)	(0.040)	(0.044)	(0.041)	(0.048)	(0.050)	(0.047)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.034	-0.014	0.042	-0.077	-0.097*	-0.075	-0.110	-0.115*
	(0.138)	(0.065)	(0.056)	(0.056)	(0.051)	(0.068)	(0.071)	(0.066)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.099	-0.066	-0.035	-0.034	-0.074	-0.159**	-0.146**	-0.190***
	(0.135)	(0.060)	(0.053)	(0.054)	(0.052)	(0.067)	(0.067)	(0.067)
N	1519	1519	1519	1515	1510	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.152	0.154	0.438	0.409	0.421	0.242	0.217	0.218
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: CovEssential, CovJob, CovWorry, CovComplState, CovCompGuidelines, Altruism, Risk, Trust. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 10: Demographics

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.269	0.021	0.094	-0.408**	0.009	-0.013	-0.045	-0.009
	(0.187)	(0.077)	(0.119)	(0.187)	(0.066)	(0.068)	(0.072)	(0.065)
Treatment Health	-0.116	0.017	0.119	-0.084	-0.027	0.012	-0.046	-0.011
	(0.189)	(0.075)	(0.113)	(0.185)	(0.065)	(0.067)	(0.074)	(0.066)
HetVar	-0.004	0.052	0.066	-0.038**	-0.076	0.132	-0.198**	-0.076
	(0.002)	(0.083)	(0.094)	(0.017)	(0.109)	(0.111)	(0.097)	(0.104)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.005	-0.067	-0.144	0.055**	-0.122	-0.002	0.087	-0.014
	(0.003)	(0.117)	(0.136)	(0.025)	(0.144)	(0.134)	(0.123)	(0.148)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.002	-0.068	-0.184	0.009	0.059	-0.130	0.077	-0.025
	(0.004)	(0.117)	(0.132)	(0.024)	(0.154)	(0.138)	(0.120)	(0.142)
N	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.153	0.152	0.153	0.155	0.152	0.152	0.152	0.151
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: Age, Male, Education, Income, Northeast, Midwest, South, West. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

2.2 Subgroup analyses

We next repeat the above heterogeneity analyses for the group of

- Section 2.2.1: Active social media users, not primed
- Section 2.2.2: Non-active social media users, not primed
- Section 2.2.3: Active social media users, primed
- Section 2.2.4: Non-active social media users, primed

2.2.1 Active social media users, not primed

Our findings from the main text are confirmed within the group of active social media users, excluding primed subjects, analysed in this section. Treatment effect is heterogeneous along pre-treatment attitude and further polarises subjects (Table 13, column 2). Treatment effect is also greater for those correctly answering the manipulation check (Table 12, column 1).

Table 11: Social media use, media consumption and trust in institutions

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Treatment Econ	0.808	0.068	0.302	0.209	0.134	0.452	0.529*
	(0.579)	(0.511)	(0.348)	(0.469)	(0.267)	(0.336)	(0.274)
Treatment Health	-0.137	0.263	0.081	0.081	-0.260	-0.325	0.202
	(0.512)	(0.560)	(0.334)	(0.395)	(0.234)	(0.345)	(0.301)
HetVar	-0.011**	0.181	-0.273***	-0.303**	-0.241	-0.411***	-0.114
	(0.005)	(0.179)	(0.098)	(0.144)	(0.242)	(0.122)	(0.119)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.009	0.052	-0.035	-0.017	0.066	-0.226	-0.280*
	(0.008)	(0.212)	(0.155)	(0.210)	(0.348)	(0.168)	(0.161)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.000	-0.124	-0.009	-0.066	0.401	0.188	-0.154
	(0.007)	(0.227)	(0.154)	(0.171)	(0.339)	(0.171)	(0.158)
N	177	177	177	177	177	177	177
R-sq	0.186	0.086	0.163	0.162	0.078	0.290	0.141
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: MediaFreq, FbUse, TwUse, MediaUse, SMnews, TrustMedia, TrustGovt. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 12: Attention and malleability

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Treatment Econ	0.224	-0.100	0.018	0.346*	0.253	0.158
	(0.218)	(0.235)	(0.296)	(0.196)	(0.169)	(0.178)
Treatment Health	0.191	-0.085	-0.041	0.069	0.094	-0.085
	(0.203)	(0.255)	(0.235)	(0.215)	(0.187)	(0.154)
HetVar	0.182	-0.144	-0.306	-0.320**	-0.276**	-0.251*
	(0.236)	(0.251)	(0.240)	(0.137)	(0.130)	(0.128)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.093	0.608	0.342	-0.419**	-0.469***	-0.030
	(0.420)	(0.373)	(0.374)	(0.171)	(0.160)	(0.216)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.701**	0.041	-0.005	-0.069	-0.180	-0.106
	(0.324)	(0.328)	(0.329)	(0.184)	(0.176)	(0.192)
N	177	177	177	177	177	177
R-sq	0.094	0.092	0.084	0.321	0.345	0.139
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: ManipCheck, FirstSignalEcon, LastSignalEcon, InfluenceOnSM, InfluenceOffSM, RTC. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 13: Pre-treatment attitudes and network

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.252	0.346**	0.210	0.205	0.311*	0.272	0.737*	0.694*
	(0.173)	(0.164)	(0.176)	(0.181)	(0.179)	(0.188)	(0.382)	(0.404)
Treatment Health	-0.013	-0.033	-0.128	-0.038	0.261	0.035	0.010	0.005
	(0.155)	(0.147)	(0.154)	(0.161)	(0.177)	(0.166)	(0.379)	(0.366)
HetVar	0.278**	0.459***	-0.145	-0.130	0.629**	0.836***	-0.216**	-0.266***
	(0.133)	(0.125)	(0.115)	(0.127)	(0.283)	(0.286)	(0.098)	(0.101)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.315*	0.403**	-0.293	-0.163	-0.354	-0.427	-0.269**	-0.226
	(0.189)	(0.171)	(0.178)	(0.180)	(0.412)	(0.407)	(0.134)	(0.147)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.276*	0.127	-0.212	-0.152	-0.986***	-0.350	-0.024	-0.054
	(0.161)	(0.155)	(0.146)	(0.164)	(0.359)	(0.370)	(0.137)	(0.132)
N	177	177	177	177	177	177	177	177
R-sq	0.090	0.446	0.190	0.117	0.107	0.142	0.235	0.252
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: PreAttitudes, SingleQ, Confidence, PolPosition, Rightwing, EconNetwork, DiscOnSM, DiscOffSM. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 14: Covid experience and social preferences

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.127	-0.120	-0.048	0.111	0.113	0.179	0.371**	0.205
	(0.228)	(0.259)	(0.144)	(0.131)	(0.141)	(0.181)	(0.172)	(0.170)
Treatment Health	0.017	-0.485**	-0.219	-0.169	-0.099	-0.000	0.065	0.042
	(0.218)	(0.224)	(0.143)	(0.119)	(0.129)	(0.160)	(0.162)	(0.162)
HetVar	-0.223	-0.289***	-0.796***	-0.923***	-0.748***	-0.296*	-0.030	-0.212*
	(0.264)	(0.100)	(0.108)	(0.116)	(0.100)	(0.155)	(0.131)	(0.112)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.164	0.298	0.127	0.132	-0.075	-0.253	-0.738***	-0.305**
	(0.382)	(0.183)	(0.155)	(0.147)	(0.144)	(0.195)	(0.154)	(0.151)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.131	0.408***	0.286*	0.334**	0.134	-0.165	-0.356**	-0.202
	(0.334)	(0.143)	(0.158)	(0.145)	(0.157)	(0.183)	(0.153)	(0.159)
N	177	177	177	177	176	177	177	177
R-sq	0.082	0.106	0.479	0.545	0.489	0.248	0.316	0.251
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: CovEssential, CovJob, CovWorry, CovComplState, CovCompGuidelines, Altruism, Risk, Trust. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 15: Demographics

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.308	0.423	0.061	0.424	0.344*	-0.029	0.145	0.257
	(0.484)	(0.261)	(0.322)	(0.619)	(0.196)	(0.206)	(0.235)	(0.220)
Treatment Health	0.244	0.248	0.327	0.876	0.057	-0.135	-0.108	-0.100
	(0.510)	(0.225)	(0.371)	(0.641)	(0.170)	(0.180)	(0.213)	(0.186)
HetVar	0.005	0.289	-0.101	0.116**	0.624	-0.498*	-0.350	0.020
	(0.008)	(0.268)	(0.293)	(0.058)	(0.454)	(0.287)	(0.289)	(0.317)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.003	-0.450	0.212	-0.027	-0.940*	1.163**	0.090	-0.345
	(0.011)	(0.378)	(0.392)	(0.085)	(0.549)	(0.448)	(0.366)	(0.393)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.007	-0.588*	-0.534	-0.127	-0.791	0.381	0.103	0.080
	(0.011)	(0.328)	(0.419)	(0.085)	(0.506)	(0.363)	(0.326)	(0.380)
N	177	177	177	177	177	177	177	177
R-sq	0.070	0.085	0.091	0.079	0.091	0.105	0.068	0.075
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: Age, Male, Education, Income, Northeast, Midwest, South, West. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

2.2.2 Non-active social media users, not primed

Table 16: Social media use, media consumption and trust in institutions

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Treatment Econ	-0.157	-0.118	0.029	-0.331*	0.043	-0.128	-0.212
	(0.127)	(0.129)	(0.100)	(0.199)	(0.098)	(0.161)	(0.158)
Treatment Health	-0.040	0.043	-0.043	0.086	0.049	0.137	-0.104
	(0.140)	(0.137)	(0.111)	(0.198)	(0.100)	(0.174)	(0.171)
HetVar	-0.007***	-0.156*	-0.160	-0.195***	-0.107	-0.319***	-0.381***
	(0.003)	(0.092)	(0.111)	(0.073)	(0.188)	(0.080)	(0.081)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.005	0.197	-0.103	0.212**	-0.166	0.098	0.205*
	(0.003)	(0.124)	(0.151)	(0.097)	(0.231)	(0.103)	(0.111)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.002	0.002	0.213	-0.034	-0.160	-0.108	0.136
	(0.004)	(0.128)	(0.142)	(0.097)	(0.268)	(0.107)	(0.118)
N	602	602	602	602	602	602	602
R-sq	0.286	0.274	0.275	0.292	0.272	0.337	0.311
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: MediaFreq, FbUse, TwUse, MediaUse, SMnews, TrustMedia, TrustGovt. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 17: Attention and malleability

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Treatment Econ	-0.055	-0.007	-0.063	0.025	0.024	-0.001
	(0.103)	(0.128)	(0.124)	(0.091)	(0.085)	(0.089)
Treatment Health	0.154	-0.087	0.105	0.005	0.004	0.009
	(0.109)	(0.124)	(0.125)	(0.091)	(0.088)	(0.090)
HetVar	-0.119	-0.013	-0.063	-0.311***	-0.313***	-0.248***
	(0.160)	(0.136)	(0.136)	(0.087)	(0.070)	(0.072)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.322	0.056	0.169	0.140	0.197**	0.152
	(0.214)	(0.183)	(0.179)	(0.107)	(0.097)	(0.100)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.444**	0.246	-0.153	-0.071	-0.017	-0.089
	(0.202)	(0.184)	(0.184)	(0.109)	(0.101)	(0.102)
N	602	602	602	602	602	602
R-sq	0.287	0.270	0.271	0.326	0.326	0.320
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: ManipCheck, FirstSignalEcon, LastSignalEcon, InfluenceOnSM, InfluenceOffSM, RTC. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 18: Pre-treatment attitudes and network

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.032	0.033	0.043	0.039	-0.237**	-0.066	-0.225*	-0.651***
	(0.090)	(0.076)	(0.090)	(0.089)	(0.107)	(0.099)	(0.124)	(0.211)
Treatment Health	0.046	0.055	0.015	0.050	-0.249**	0.035	-0.145	-0.305
	(0.095)	(0.078)	(0.089)	(0.093)	(0.108)	(0.105)	(0.127)	(0.232)
HetVar	0.380***	0.516***	-0.189**	-0.184**	-0.336**	0.161	-0.194***	-0.311***
	(0.082)	(0.073)	(0.081)	(0.084)	(0.144)	(0.171)	(0.059)	(0.062)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.171*	0.074	0.016	0.257**	0.671***	0.388*	0.197**	0.317***
	(0.102)	(0.086)	(0.121)	(0.111)	(0.189)	(0.221)	(0.085)	(0.090)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.116	0.122	-0.179	0.150	0.828***	-0.012	0.146*	0.161*
	(0.119)	(0.085)	(0.114)	(0.119)	(0.201)	(0.230)	(0.079)	(0.097)
N	602	602	602	602	602	602	602	602
R-sq	0.271	0.486	0.322	0.277	0.293	0.282	0.286	0.315
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: PreAttitudes, SingleQ, Confidence, PolPosition, Rightwing, EconNetwork, DiscOnSM, DiscOffSM. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 19: Covid experience and social preferences

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.031	-0.029	0.064	0.112	0.074	0.024	0.043	0.013
	(0.099)	(0.106)	(0.078)	(0.079)	(0.078)	(0.087)	(0.091)	(0.089)
Treatment Health	0.074	0.108	0.064	0.006	-0.017	-0.031	-0.001	0.011
	(0.107)	(0.115)	(0.077)	(0.078)	(0.078)	(0.089)	(0.091)	(0.091)
HetVar	0.128	-0.034	-0.538***	-0.550***	-0.531***	-0.244***	-0.200**	-0.111
	(0.158)	(0.076)	(0.062)	(0.062)	(0.056)	(0.073)	(0.083)	(0.075)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.028	0.068	0.098	0.027	-0.050	0.074	0.208*	0.078
	(0.220)	(0.105)	(0.085)	(0.086)	(0.074)	(0.112)	(0.119)	(0.105)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.115	-0.072	-0.038	0.032	-0.002	-0.110	-0.099	-0.161
	(0.219)	(0.099)	(0.087)	(0.077)	(0.076)	(0.100)	(0.119)	(0.109)
N	602	602	602	599	596	602	602	602
R-sq	0.268	0.271	0.483	0.489	0.495	0.334	0.300	0.289
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: CovEssential, CovJob, CovWorry, CovComplState, CovCompGuidelines, Altruism, Risk, Trust. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 20: Demographics

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.376	0.013	0.102	-0.768***	0.017	-0.024	0.009	0.070
	(0.297)	(0.117)	(0.196)	(0.280)	(0.103)	(0.106)	(0.106)	(0.100)
Treatment Health	-0.284	0.033	0.197	-0.486	-0.015	0.034	-0.005	0.130
	(0.329)	(0.121)	(0.187)	(0.310)	(0.105)	(0.110)	(0.115)	(0.104)
HetVar	-0.013***	0.103	-0.002	-0.086***	-0.232	-0.030	-0.173	0.218
	(0.004)	(0.137)	(0.157)	(0.029)	(0.162)	(0.166)	(0.158)	(0.177)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.008	0.015	-0.111	0.110***	-0.015	0.180	0.030	-0.269
	(0.005)	(0.181)	(0.221)	(0.036)	(0.205)	(0.201)	(0.194)	(0.230)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.007	0.014	-0.215	0.074*	0.314	0.020	0.114	-0.489**
	(0.006)	(0.190)	(0.214)	(0.041)	(0.229)	(0.215)	(0.194)	(0.234)
N	602	602	602	602	602	602	602	602
R-sq	0.269	0.266	0.267	0.277	0.269	0.267	0.267	0.272
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: Age, Male, Education, Income, Northeast, Midwest, South, West. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

2.2.3 Active social media users, primed

Table 21: Social media use, media consumption and trust in institutions

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Treatment Econ	0.125	0.564	-0.072	0.175	0.300	0.176	0.033
	(0.463)	(0.534)	(0.263)	(0.325)	(0.219)	(0.330)	(0.302)
Treatment Health	-0.371	0.655	0.533	0.928**	0.298	0.856**	0.350
	(0.486)	(0.475)	(0.326)	(0.365)	(0.232)	(0.376)	(0.296)
HetVar	-0.012***	0.179	-0.139	-0.121	0.102	-0.357***	-0.275**
	(0.004)	(0.159)	(0.105)	(0.102)	(0.218)	(0.135)	(0.116)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.002	-0.237	0.036	-0.108	-0.588*	-0.060	-0.019
	(0.006)	(0.215)	(0.133)	(0.144)	(0.312)	(0.163)	(0.158)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.009	-0.176	-0.175	-0.352**	-0.180	-0.252	-0.060
	(0.007)	(0.201)	(0.148)	(0.150)	(0.322)	(0.177)	(0.159)
N	148	148	148	148	148	148	148
R-sq	0.221	0.127	0.184	0.255	0.148	0.358	0.202
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: MediaFreq, FbUse, TwUse, MediaUse, SMnews, TrustMedia, TrustGovt. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 22: Attention and malleability

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Treatment Econ	-0.138	-0.038	0.150	-0.104	-0.126	0.001
	(0.176)	(0.209)	(0.221)	(0.196)	(0.173)	(0.151)
Treatment Health	0.466**	0.395	0.381	0.108	0.124	0.252
	(0.212)	(0.240)	(0.247)	(0.195)	(0.181)	(0.163)
HetVar	-0.035	0.172	0.060	-0.349***	-0.407***	-0.164**
	(0.249)	(0.217)	(0.227)	(0.121)	(0.115)	(0.080)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.516	0.037	-0.382	0.058	0.067	0.018
	(0.346)	(0.316)	(0.331)	(0.159)	(0.171)	(0.143)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.570*	-0.341	-0.359	0.065	0.101	-0.100
	(0.331)	(0.328)	(0.330)	(0.155)	(0.163)	(0.142)
N	148	148	148	148	148	148
R-sq	0.180	0.133	0.145	0.207	0.236	0.170
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: ManipCheck, FirstSignalEcon, LastSignalEcon, InfluenceOnSM, InfluenceOffSM, RTC. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 23: Pre-treatment attitudes and network

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.034	0.087	-0.043	-0.050	0.036	-0.055	-0.200	-0.303
	(0.150)	(0.132)	(0.135)	(0.156)	(0.174)	(0.172)	(0.328)	(0.427)
Treatment Health	0.160	0.159	0.190	0.177	0.267	0.054	-0.089	-0.107
	(0.156)	(0.142)	(0.160)	(0.166)	(0.178)	(0.176)	(0.363)	(0.455)
HetVar	-0.059	0.437***	-0.258**	-0.185*	0.341	0.043	-0.221**	-0.274**
	(0.118)	(0.112)	(0.114)	(0.110)	(0.269)	(0.297)	(0.088)	(0.111)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.092	0.097	-0.153	0.005	-0.226	0.069	0.034	0.082
	(0.147)	(0.146)	(0.139)	(0.159)	(0.375)	(0.365)	(0.124)	(0.149)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.290*	0.176	0.122	-0.012	-0.164	0.510	0.121	0.124
	(0.172)	(0.168)	(0.164)	(0.140)	(0.413)	(0.418)	(0.127)	(0.153)
N	148	148	148	148	148	148	148	148
R-sq	0.144	0.478	0.244	0.154	0.123	0.151	0.182	0.201
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: PreAttitudes, SingleQ, Confidence, PolPosition, Rightwing, EconNetwork, DiscOnSM, DiscOffSM. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 24: Covid experience and social preferences

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.067	-0.051	0.010	0.046	0.057	-0.069	-0.015	0.090
	(0.198)	(0.211)	(0.183)	(0.146)	(0.129)	(0.150)	(0.160)	(0.164)
Treatment Health	0.226	0.133	0.181	0.177	0.262*	0.156	0.177	0.329*
	(0.230)	(0.234)	(0.159)	(0.148)	(0.140)	(0.170)	(0.171)	(0.170)
HetVar	0.117	0.028	-0.390**	-0.357**	-0.355***	-0.287**	-0.183*	0.003
	(0.233)	(0.112)	(0.159)	(0.165)	(0.128)	(0.123)	(0.103)	(0.111)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.193	0.020	-0.010	-0.251	-0.364**	-0.101	-0.085	-0.313*
	(0.357)	(0.165)	(0.204)	(0.222)	(0.172)	(0.151)	(0.140)	(0.163)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.024	0.069	-0.217	-0.262	-0.345**	-0.012	-0.050	-0.367**
	(0.338)	(0.180)	(0.175)	(0.184)	(0.156)	(0.192)	(0.152)	(0.175)
N	148	148	148	148	148	148	148	148
R-sq	0.131	0.127	0.419	0.397	0.457	0.235	0.189	0.203
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: CovEssential, CovJob, CovWorry, CovComplState, CovCompGuidelines, Altruism, Risk, Trust. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 25: Demographics

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	0.578	0.280	0.321	0.459	-0.014	0.036	-0.031	-0.115
	(0.417)	(0.206)	(0.306)	(0.564)	(0.173)	(0.172)	(0.190)	(0.175)
Treatment Health	0.529	0.463**	0.459	0.850	0.212	0.137	0.410*	0.165
	(0.429)	(0.209)	(0.327)	(0.703)	(0.177)	(0.182)	(0.217)	(0.204)
HetVar	0.008	0.156	0.419	0.101	-0.175	0.544	-0.123	-0.826***
	(0.007)	(0.198)	(0.255)	(0.068)	(0.275)	(0.329)	(0.289)	(0.248)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.015	-0.557*	-0.492	-0.065	-0.046	-0.332	-0.027	0.496
	(0.010)	(0.299)	(0.371)	(0.075)	(0.346)	(0.380)	(0.335)	(0.387)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.007	-0.410	-0.342	-0.085	0.032	0.400	-0.447	0.233
	(0.011)	(0.327)	(0.387)	(0.092)	(0.500)	(0.456)	(0.346)	(0.303)
N	148	148	148	148	148	148	148	148
R-sq	0.132	0.139	0.133	0.125	0.121	0.142	0.135	0.128
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: Age, Male, Education, Income, Northeast, Midwest, South, West. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

2.2.4 Non-active social media users, primed

Table 26: Social media use, media consumption and trust in institutions

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Treatment Econ	0.119	0.012	-0.022	-0.097	0.002	0.121	0.210
	(0.125)	(0.130)	(0.100)	(0.203)	(0.095)	(0.145)	(0.163)
Treatment Health	0.098	0.011	-0.081	0.164	-0.071	0.052	0.097
	(0.128)	(0.124)	(0.102)	(0.186)	(0.094)	(0.155)	(0.164)
HetVar	-0.001	-0.014	-0.113	-0.081	-0.170	-0.261***	-0.027
	(0.002)	(0.086)	(0.090)	(0.064)	(0.158)	(0.072)	(0.085)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.006*	-0.087	-0.086	0.022	-0.364	-0.153	-0.246**
	(0.003)	(0.119)	(0.135)	(0.098)	(0.232)	(0.095)	(0.123)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.006*	-0.149	-0.018	-0.138	-0.108	-0.131	-0.158
	(0.003)	(0.135)	(0.134)	(0.089)	(0.232)	(0.100)	(0.117)
N	592	592	592	592	592	592	592
R-sq	0.244	0.229	0.231	0.242	0.241	0.319	0.248
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: MediaFreq, FbUse, TwUse, MediaUse, SMnews, TrustMedia, TrustGovt. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 27: Attention and malleability

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Treatment Econ	-0.163	0.082	-0.145	-0.099	-0.082	-0.063
	(0.108)	(0.137)	(0.121)	(0.086)	(0.086)	(0.087)
Treatment Health	-0.063	-0.094	-0.190	-0.081	-0.109	-0.119
	(0.101)	(0.128)	(0.124)	(0.086)	(0.085)	(0.087)
HetVar	0.015	0.179	-0.102	-0.264***	-0.220***	-0.212***
	(0.131)	(0.120)	(0.118)	(0.069)	(0.065)	(0.070)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.305	-0.250	0.191	-0.109	-0.062	0.131
	(0.188)	(0.178)	(0.178)	(0.102)	(0.104)	(0.105)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.077	0.009	0.224	0.106	0.024	0.024
	(0.196)	(0.176)	(0.174)	(0.103)	(0.104)	(0.098)
N	592	592	592	592	592	592
R-sq	0.232	0.229	0.226	0.284	0.274	0.250
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: ManipCheck, FirstSignalEcon, LastSignalEcon, InfluenceOnSM, InfluenceOffSM, RTC. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 28: Pre-treatment attitudes and network

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.054	-0.021	-0.056	-0.055	-0.024	-0.067	0.238**	-0.017
	(0.088)	(0.076)	(0.087)	(0.088)	(0.114)	(0.095)	(0.116)	(0.205)
Treatment Health	-0.085	-0.029	-0.065	-0.079	-0.023	-0.063	0.027	-0.076
	(0.088)	(0.072)	(0.084)	(0.085)	(0.108)	(0.095)	(0.118)	(0.207)
HetVar	0.500***	0.453***	-0.197***	-0.020	0.244**	0.604***	0.057	-0.010
	(0.071)	(0.075)	(0.068)	(0.079)	(0.124)	(0.152)	(0.057)	(0.064)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.121	0.037	0.022	-0.023	-0.075	-0.058	-0.235***	-0.018
	(0.107)	(0.091)	(0.106)	(0.106)	(0.176)	(0.212)	(0.080)	(0.093)
Treatment Health x HetVar	-0.070	0.084	-0.090	-0.082	-0.176	-0.197	-0.088	-0.004
	(0.101)	(0.091)	(0.108)	(0.104)	(0.179)	(0.213)	(0.084)	(0.093)
N	592	592	592	592	592	592	592	592
R-sq	0.226	0.421	0.266	0.226	0.225	0.265	0.243	0.224
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: PreAttitudes, SingleQ, Confidence, PolPosition, Rightwing, EconNetwork, DiscOnSM, DiscOffSM. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 29: Covid experience and social preferences

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.003	0.049	-0.116	-0.058	-0.069	-0.087	-0.094	-0.068
	(0.101)	(0.108)	(0.076)	(0.079)	(0.078)	(0.086)	(0.089)	(0.085)
Treatment Health	-0.097	0.041	-0.121	-0.075	-0.072	-0.094	-0.084	-0.092
	(0.096)	(0.106)	(0.075)	(0.079)	(0.078)	(0.083)	(0.083)	(0.083)
HetVar	0.092	0.044	-0.432***	-0.297***	-0.329***	-0.025	-0.101	-0.152**
	(0.142)	(0.065)	(0.071)	(0.078)	(0.072)	(0.078)	(0.080)	(0.073)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	-0.183	-0.142	-0.033	-0.240**	-0.180**	-0.217**	-0.193	-0.126
	(0.207)	(0.098)	(0.096)	(0.096)	(0.087)	(0.108)	(0.118)	(0.107)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.065	-0.161*	-0.102	-0.184**	-0.181**	-0.296***	-0.167	-0.139
	(0.214)	(0.086)	(0.088)	(0.091)	(0.084)	(0.112)	(0.109)	(0.105)
N	592	592	592	591	590	592	592	592
R-sq	0.226	0.232	0.423	0.403	0.422	0.275	0.271	0.280
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: CovEssential, CovJob, CovWorry, CovComplState, CovCompGuidelines, Altruism, Risk, Trust. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 30: Demographics

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Treatment Econ	-0.358	-0.031	0.276*	0.126	-0.017	0.048	-0.128	-0.138
	(0.324)	(0.121)	(0.168)	(0.238)	(0.098)	(0.103)	(0.115)	(0.097)
Treatment Health	-0.126	-0.119	-0.046	0.238	-0.073	0.033	-0.117	-0.186*
	(0.285)	(0.110)	(0.154)	(0.217)	(0.093)	(0.099)	(0.114)	(0.097)
HetVar	-0.003	0.065	0.216*	0.003	0.067	0.304*	-0.112	-0.215
	(0.004)	(0.118)	(0.125)	(0.021)	(0.167)	(0.166)	(0.142)	(0.141)
Treatment Econ x HetVar	0.006	-0.048	-0.447**	-0.026	-0.213	-0.460**	0.196	0.348
	(0.006)	(0.173)	(0.194)	(0.032)	(0.237)	(0.203)	(0.184)	(0.228)
Treatment Health x HetVar	0.001	0.080	-0.052	-0.046	-0.066	-0.555***	0.095	0.468**
	(0.005)	(0.176)	(0.186)	(0.030)	(0.241)	(0.198)	(0.176)	(0.213)
N	592	592	592	592	592	592	592	592
R-sq	0.225	0.224	0.231	0.226	0.225	0.233	0.225	0.230
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Notes: OLS regressions with the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. **HetVar** for each column in order: Age, Male, Education, Income, Northeast, Midwest, South, West. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

3 Mediation analysis

3.1 Pooled sample

Our hypothesis is that higher popularity on a particular policy view will move subjects closer towards that view, this is mediated by a learning mechanism. Subjects are hypothesised to pay attention to the tweets by reading their contents and noticing the numbers of "likes" and "retweets", learn that a particular view is more popular, and update their attitude to conform to the more popular view.

We therefore conduct the following 2SLS analysis for each of the pro-economy and pro-health treatments. In the first stage, being exposed to pro-econ tweets should result a higher likelihood of subjects answering "pro-econ" to the question "Which of these two views had more likes in the 6 tweets shown earlier?", which is asked after the questions on post-treatment policy preferences. This is captured by a dummy $proEconTweetsAwareness_i$ which equals 1 if the subject answers correctly ("pro-econ") and 0 otherwise. We hypothesise that $\beta_1 > 0$ for a strong first stage.

$$proEconTweetsAwareness_i = \alpha + \beta_1 ProEconTreatment_i + \delta PreAttitudes_i + \varepsilon_i$$

In the second stage, we study whether subjects who learned from the popular social media view are more likely to shift their attitude towards that view. We therefore estimate the following regression:

$$PostAttitudes_i = \alpha + \beta_1 \hat{ProEconTweetAwareness_i} + \delta PreAttitudes_i + \varepsilon_i$$

where $\hat{ProEconTweetAwareness_i}$ is the predicted value from the first stage equation.

Even if the first stage is not strong, indicating that subjects do not consciously learn from the tweets they are shown, another channel through which the treatment works is subconscious learning. We therefore run the following reduced-form regression:

$$PostAttitudes_i = \alpha + \beta_1 ProEconTreatment_i + \delta PreAttitudes_i + \varepsilon_i$$

If learning happens subconsciously, we hypothesise that $\beta_1 > 0$. We also test whether replacing $ProEconTreatment$ with $firstsignalecon$ ($lastsignalecon$), a dummy variable which equals 1 if the first (last) signal shown is pro-econ, to study whether subjects pay more attention to the first (last) signal they are exposed to. We then repeat the analysis with the pro-health treatment.

Table 31: Mediation analysis (pro-economy)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Econ	0.055**		-0.004						
	(0.023)		(0.050)						
Econ tweet awareness		-0.076			-10.888*			2.284	
		(0.908)			(5.697)			(2.197)	
First signal Econ				-0.008		0.090*			
				(0.021)		(0.047)			
Last signal Econ							-0.022		-0.049
							(0.021)		(0.048)
N	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.070	0.151	0.151	0.066	0.153	0.153	0.067	0.152	0.152
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	11.200			10.650			10.712		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 32: Mediation analysis (pro-health)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Health	0.035		-0.010						
	(0.025)		(0.051)						
Health tweet awareness		-0.299			-2.331*			-1.265	
		(1.465)			(1.220)			(1.217)	
First signal Health				0.039*		-0.090*			
				(0.023)		(0.047)			
Last signal Health							-0.039*		0.049
							(0.023)		(0.048)
N	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519	1519
R-sq	0.028	0.151	0.151	0.029	0.153	0.153	0.029	0.152	0.152
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	4.605			4.709			4.750		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. Treatment Econ (Health) equals 1 for the pro-economy (pro-health) treatment and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

3.2 Subgroup analyses

We next repeat the above analyses for the group of

- Section 3.2.1: Active social media users, not primed, for US and EU samples separately
- Section 3.2.2: Non-active social media users, not primed, for US and EU samples separately
- Section 3.2.3: Active social media users, primed, US sample only
- Section 3.2.4: Non-active social media users, primed, US sample only

3.2.1 Active social media users, not primed

Table 33: Mediation analysis (pro-economy)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Econ	-0.054		0.218						
	(0.070)		(0.156)						
Econ tweet awareness		-4.018			-1.314			11.212	
		(2.873)			(2.711)			(8.661)	
First signal Econ				-0.055		0.072			
				(0.066)		(0.149)			
Last signal Econ							-0.016		-0.184
							(0.066)		(0.142)
N	177	177	177	177	177	177	177	177	177
R-sq	0.063	0.067	0.067	0.064	0.057	0.057	0.060	0.064	0.064
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	1.404			1.370			1.345		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. First signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the first tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 34: Mediation analysis (pro-health)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Health	0.036		-0.163						
	(0.076)		(0.136)						
Health tweet awareness		-4.562			-2.158			-5.965	
		(3.789)			(4.452)			(4.608)	
First signal Health				0.034		-0.072			
				(0.073)		(0.149)			
Last signal Health							-0.031		0.184
							(0.074)		(0.142)
N	177	177	177	177	177	177	177	177	177
R-sq	0.092	0.062	0.062	0.092	0.057	0.057	0.092	0.064	0.064
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	2.393			2.464			2.451		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. Last signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the last tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

3.2.2 Non-active social media users, not primed

Table 35: Mediation analysis (pro-economy)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Econ	0.009		0.001						
	(0.035)		(0.075)						
Econ tweet awareness		0.079			10.147			1.339	
		(8.464)			(8.366)			(1.660)	
First signal Econ				0.009		0.088			
				(0.032)		(0.073)			
Last signal Econ							-0.045		-0.060
							(0.032)		(0.075)
N	602	602	602	602	602	602	602	602	602
R-sq	0.097	0.266	0.266	0.097	0.268	0.268	0.100	0.267	0.267
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	6.816			6.845			7.050		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. First signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the first tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 36: Mediation analysis (pro-health)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Health	-0.007		0.029						
	(0.038)		(0.079)						
Health tweet awareness		-4.185			-2.038			-0.955	
		(11.349)			(1.680)			(1.184)	
First signal Health				0.043		-0.088			
				(0.036)		(0.073)			
Last signal Health							-0.063*		0.060
							(0.036)		(0.075)
N	602	602	602	602	602	602	602	602	602
R-sq	0.036	0.266	0.266	0.038	0.268	0.268	0.041	0.267	0.267
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	2.448			2.656			2.634		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. Last signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the last tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

3.2.3 Active social media users, primed

Table 37: Mediation analysis (pro-economy)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Econ	-0.009		-0.143						
	(0.070)		(0.134)						
Econ tweet awareness		15.645			0.850			2.020	
		(14.672)			(1.672)			(1.384)	
First signal Econ				0.083		0.070			
				(0.066)		(0.138)			
Last signal Econ							-0.099		-0.200
							(0.068)		(0.137)
N	148	148	148	148	148	148	148	148	148
R-sq	0.165	0.110	0.110	0.175	0.105	0.105	0.179	0.118	0.118
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	3.246			3.445			3.865		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. First signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the first tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 38: Mediation analysis (pro-health)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Health	0.126		0.229						
	(0.084)		(0.146)						
Health tweet awareness		1.820			4.625			-1.641	
		(1.158)			(9.093)			(1.124)	
First signal Health				-0.015		-0.070			
				(0.079)		(0.138)			
Last signal Health							-0.122		0.200
							(0.080)		(0.137)
N	148	148	148	148	148	148	148	148	148
R-sq	0.077	0.121	0.121	0.061	0.105	0.105	0.077	0.118	0.118
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	1.515			1.290			1.648		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. Last signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the last tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

3.2.4 Non-active social media users, primed

Table 39: Mediation analysis (pro-economy)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Econ	0.158***		-0.011						
	(0.039)		(0.079)						
Econ tweet awareness		-0.072			-2.109			1.968	
		(0.501)			(1.569)			(3.915)	
First signal Econ				-0.046		0.096			
				(0.035)		(0.072)			
Last signal Econ							0.019		0.036
							(0.035)		(0.073)
N	592	592	592	592	592	592	592	592	592
R-sq	0.081	0.222	0.222	0.055	0.225	0.225	0.053	0.223	0.223
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	4.570			3.251			3.054		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. First signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the first tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

Table 40: Mediation analysis (pro-health)

	Treatment			First signal			Last signal		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Treatment Health	0.041		-0.057						
	(0.040)		(0.077)						
Health tweet awareness		-1.390			-1.815			-3.789	
		(1.880)			(1.350)			(7.540)	
First signal Health				0.053		-0.096			
				(0.037)		(0.072)			
Last signal Health							0.010		-0.036
							(0.036)		(0.073)
N	592	592	592	592	592	592	592	592	592
R-sq	0.045	0.223	0.223	0.046	0.225	0.225	0.043	0.223	0.223
Pre-attitudes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
F	2.757			2.819			2.660		

Notes: OLS regressions with tweet awareness (columns 1, 4 and 7) and the post-treatment attitudes index (first principal component of the responses to the post-treatment policy questions) (all other columns) as outcome. Last signal Econ (Health) equals 1 if the last tweet shown is pro-economy (pro-health) and 0 otherwise. Econ (Health) tweet awareness equals 1 if the subject perceives pro-economy (health) as the more popular view. Pre-attitude is defined as PC1, the first principal component of the pre-treatment policy questions. Controls include age, gender, region (USA midwest, USA northeast, USA south, USA west), education, income and political position. Robust standard errors in parenthesis, significance levels indicated *p<0.10, ** p<0.05, ***p<0.01.

References

Falk, Armin, Anke Becker, Thomas Dohmen, Benjamin Enke, David Huffman, and Uwe Sunde. 2018. "Global evidence on economic preferences." *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 133(4): 1645–1692.

Oreg, Shaul. 2003. "Resistance to change: Developing an individual differences measure." *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 88(4): 680.