

Beliefs about Racial Discrimination

Pre-Analysis Plan IV

Ingar Haaland* Christopher Roth†

October 24, 2018

In a fourth round of data collection, we explore whether shocking people's stereotypes about blacks affects people's support pro-black labor market policies.

1 Introduction

We collect data on whether shocking people's stereotypes about blacks affects people's support pro-black labor market policies. In this document, we outline our plan for analysis of the data. This data collection supplements previous data collections described in Pre-Analysis Plan I, Pre-Analysis Plan II, and Pre-Analaysis Plan III. The pre-analysis plans for all four data collections are uploaded to the same AEA RCT Registry trial.

2 Setting and sample size

We plan to collect 3000 respondents on Amazon Mechanical Turk. We only allow respondents based in the United States to participate in the survey.

*Department of Economics, NHH Norwegian School of Economics;
e-mail: Ingar.Haaland@nhh.no

†Institute on Behavior & Inequality; email: Chris.Roth@briq-institute.org

3 Experimental design

The respondents are randomized into a treatment group and a control group. Respondents in both conditions are asked about which factors they think blacks and whites rate as least important in a job. On top of that, respondents in the treatment group receive information about which factors blacks and whites actually rate as least important in a job. Respondents in the control group do not receive this information.

4 Analysis

4.1 Main specification

In our main specification, we investigate whether the treatment affects people's support for pro-black policies. To examine this question, we estimate the following OLS specification:

$$y_i = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 T_i + \alpha_2 \mathbf{x}_i + \varepsilon_i \quad (1)$$

where

- y_i — individual i 's support for either (i) black preference in hiring or (ii) black assistance in getting a job. We code both of these variables from 1: Strongly oppose to 5: Strongly support. We z-score each variable by subtracting the control group mean and dividing by the control group standard deviation. To address issues of multiple hypothesis testing, we create an index, which is defined as the average of the two z-scored variables.¹
- T_i — an indicator for whether respondent i was in the treatment group.
- \mathbf{x}_i — a vector of controls which is defined further below.
- ε_i — an individual-specific error term. We use robust error terms for inference.

We expect $\alpha_1 > 0$; i.e., receiving the information should increase people's support for pro-black policies.

¹To explore mechanisms, we also estimate equation (1) using people's post-treatment beliefs about whether racial differences in economic outcomes are due to "whites working harder than blacks" as the outcome variable. This outcome will be coded from 1: "Strongly disagree" to 7: "Strongly agree" and then z-scored by the control group mean and standard deviation.

4.2 Heterogeneity based on people's prior beliefs

Our second specification, which we also estimate using OLS, is given as follows:

$$y_i = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 \text{Treatment}_i + \alpha_2 \text{Treatment}_i \times \text{prior}_i + \alpha_3 \text{prior}_i + \alpha_4 \mathbf{x}_i + \varepsilon_i \quad (2)$$

where prior_i is an indicator taking the value 1 for respondents who thought that blacks most commonly answered “Working hours are short, lots of free time” as least the important factor in a job.

We expect $\alpha_2 < 0$; i.e., we should observe smaller treatment effects for respondents who initially had correct beliefs about the motivations of blacks.

4.3 Coding of controls

We include the following variables as controls in the regressions:

- We include a gender dummy.
- We include two ethnicity dummies: one dummy for being non-Hispanic white and one dummy for being non-Hispanic black
- We include two party affiliation dummies: one dummy equal to one if respondent i considers herself to be a Democrat and a dummy equal to one if respondent i considers herself to be a Republican.
- We also include a dummy taking the value 1 for respondents who thought that blacks most commonly answered “Working hours are short, lots of free time” as the least important factor in a job.
- We include a dummy for whether the respondent has at least a 2-year college degree.
- Age will be coded continuously.
- Household income will be coded as the log of the midpoint of the interval specified by the respondent.

For robustness, we will also report the main treatment effects without inclusion of controls.

5 Experimental instructions

5.1 General instructions

General instructions

This study is conducted by The Choice Lab at NHH Norwegian School of Economics.

You must be a US citizen of at least 18 years of age to participate in this study. If you do not fulfill these requirements, please do not continue any further.

You are not allowed to participate in this study more than once. If you experience a technical error or problem, do not try to restart or retake the study. Rather, send us an email with a description of your problem and we will get back to you.

Please note that your participation will be registered on the following Amazon Mechanical Turk worker ID:

`#{e://Field/workerId}`

The worker ID was retrieved automatically when you clicked on the link that brought you here. This step is necessary for assigning payments to the right account and to ensure that you only participate in this study once.

If you have any questions regarding this study, please email thechoicelab@nhh.no.

I have read and understood the above and want to participate in this study. [Yes, No]

5.2 Pre-treatment background questions

1. Please indicate your gender. [Male, Female]
2. What is your age? [18–24; 25–34; 35–44; 45–54; 55–64; 65 or older]
3. Which category best describes your highest level of education? [Eighth grade or less, Some high school, High school degree/GED, Some college, 2-year college degree, 4-year college degree, Master's degree, Doctoral degree, Professional degree (JD, MD, MBA)]
4. What was your family's gross household income in 2017 in US dollars? [Less than \$15,000; \$15,000 to \$24,999; \$25,000 to \$49,999; \$50,000 to \$74,999; \$75,000 to \$99,999; \$100,000 to \$149,999; \$150,000 to \$200,000; More than \$200,000]

5. Which of the following best describes your race or ethnicity? [African American/Black; Asian/Asian American; Caucasian/White; Native American, Inuit or Aleut; Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander; Other; Prefer not to answer]
6. Are you of Hispanic, Latino, or Spanish origin? [Yes, No]
7. In politics, as of today, do you consider yourself a Republican, a Democrat, or an Independent? [Republican, Democrat, Independent]
8. In politics, as of today, do you lean towards the Republican Party or lean towards the Democratic Party? [The Republican Party, The Democratic Party; *note: question only shown to Independents*]

5.3 Pre-treatment beliefs

In this survey, we will ask you some questions about whites and blacks in America.

Throughout this survey, we will refer to non-Hispanic whites and non-Hispanic blacks as whites and blacks, respectively.

{page break}

The General Social Survey

Since 1972, the General Social Survey (GSS) has provided politicians, policymakers, and scholars with a clear and unbiased perspective on what Americans think and feel about such issues as national spending priorities, crime and punishment, intergroup relations, and confidence in institutions.



The General Social Survey (GSS) is a large and representative survey of Americans.

In the survey, people were asked to rank the importance of the following five job characteristics (from least important to most important):

- High income
- No danger of being fired
- Working hours are short, lots of free time
- Chances for advancement
- Work that is important and gives a feeling of accomplishment

Among **whites**, which response do you think was most commonly chosen as the **least** important characteristic of a job?

- High income
- No danger of being fired
- Working hours are short, lots of free time
- Chances for advancement
- Work that is important and gives a feeling of accomplishment

Among **blacks**, which response do you think was most commonly chosen as the **least** important characteristic of a job?

- High income
- No danger of being fired
- Working hours are short, lots of free time
- Chances for advancement
- Work that is important and gives a feeling of accomplishment

5.4 Information treatment

The General Social Survey

Since 1972, the General Social Survey (GSS) has provided politicians, policymakers, and scholars with a clear and unbiased perspective on what Americans think and feel about such issues as national spending priorities, crime and punishment, intergroup relations, and confidence in institutions.



The actual results on which response people most commonly chose as **least** important characteristic of a job were as follows:

Among **whites**, the response “Working hours are short, lots of free time” was most commonly chosen as the **least** important characteristic of a job.

Among **blacks**, the response “Working hours are short, lots of free time” was most commonly chosen as the **least** important characteristic of a job.

Source: The General Social Survey

5.5 Views on pro-black policies

We will now ask you a few questions about your attitudes towards policies to help blacks in the labor market.

{page break}

Do you support or oppose government and private programs that give qualified black candidates preference over equally qualified white candidates in getting a job?

Strongly support

Support

Neither support nor oppose

Oppose

Strongly oppose

{page break, note: We randomize the order of these two questions}

Do you support or oppose government and private programs that give qualified black candidates assistance in getting a job?

Strongly support

Support

Neither support nor oppose

Oppose

Strongly oppose

5.6 Post-treatment beliefs

To what extent do you agree with the following statement:

“Differences in economic outcomes between whites and blacks are primarily the result of whites working harder than blacks.”

Strongly agree

Agree

Somewhat agree

Neither agree nor disagree

Somewhat disagree

Disagree

Strongly disagree