

Geographic Mobility and National Identity: Pre-analysis plan*

Manuel Bagues Christopher Roth

January 30, 2020

Abstract

We study how exogenous variation in geographic mobility affects people's beliefs and their national identity. We combine a unique natural experiment, the random assignment of male conscripts to different locations throughout Spain, with unique survey data on preferences, beliefs and identity. We examine whether being randomly assigned to complete the military service outside of one's region of residence has a long-lasting impact on people's sense of national identity and their beliefs. In this pre-analysis plan we specify (i) our main empirical specifications, (ii) the set of outcomes we plan to analyze, (iii) the sample size and sample inclusion criteria, (iv) power calculations based on pilot data, (v) adjustment for multiple hypothesis testing, and (vi) the exact experimental instructions used.

Keywords: Identity, military service, regional migration, intergroup exposure, beliefs.

JEL Classification: R23, D91, Z1

*Manuel Bagues, University of Warwick, J-Pal, CEPR, IZA; email: Manuel.Bagues@Warwick.ac.uk; Christopher Roth, University of Warwick, briq, CESifo, CAGE, CEPR; email: Christopher.Roth@warwick.ac.uk. We received ethics approval from the University of Warwick (HSSREC 55/19-20). We thank Peter Andre, Matt Lowe, Benjamin Enke, Lukas Hensel, Andreas Stegman, and Florian Zimmermann for useful suggestions.

1 Motivation

Separatist movements play an important role in the political debate in Europe. The Northern League in Italy which demands independence of the northern parts of Italy, and the Independence movement in Catalonia are two prime examples. A core motive behind such separatist movements is the feeling that the regional identity is far more important than the national identity. Citizens are divided in the extent to which they support separatist movements and mostly identify with their region rather than with the nation state. What determines the heterogeneity in identification with the nation? What is the role of people's experiences made during their impressionable years? What policies are effective in strengthening people's national identity? How does regional mobility and subsequent exposure to people from other parts of the country affect people's beliefs, and their sense of identity?

We shed light on these questions using a unique natural experiment in Spain. We study how exogenous variation in geographic mobility, i.e. the likelihood of temporarily moving to a different region for the military service, affects people's formation of identity. We combine a unique natural experiment, the random assignment of male conscripts to different locations throughout Spain, with unique self-collected survey data on people's preferences, their beliefs as well as their identity. In our main empirical specifications we compare individuals that were randomly assigned to complete the military service outside of their region of residence with others randomly assigned to complete it in their region of residence.

2 The natural experiment

Spain had a compulsory military service until the year 2001. The duration of the service was 18 months before 1981, with the exception of the Navy, where it lasted for 24 months. During the 1980s and 1990s the length of the service was progressively reduced, first to 12 months, and later on to 9 months.

Young males were summoned to serve in the military in the year they turned 20.¹ People who had not completed their education by this age could apply for an extension until age 26. Some individuals were exempted from serving due to medical reasons (around 20% of the cohort) or because they had already volunteered for the professional army (around 10%). Since the mid 80s individuals were also allowed to serve in the social service ('prestación social sustitutoria') as an alternative to the military service. The social service lasted 6 months longer than the military service and it attracted relatively few people.

A large share of conscripts were assigned to serve outside their region of origin. Each year, a public lottery decided the region where each conscript would serve, as well as the branch of the military and the starting date. Some years, especially in the mid 80s, the number of eligible conscripts exceeded the capacity of the military and some individuals were exempted from serving by luck of the draw (surplus quota). The lottery was conducted at the province of residence one year before the start of the service. For the years 1987 to 1991 the lottery was based on the date of birth as well as the province of residence and we observe the exact assignment rule, allowing us to verify compliance with the assignment mechanism. From 1991 onwards conscripts were allowed to select some destinations. Otherwise they were assigned using the lottery.

3 Sample

Administration In our pilot from December 2019 we collaborated with Luc.id, an online panel provider widely used in the social sciences (Coppock and McClellan, 2019; Wood and Porter, 2019). This provider had some constraints on how much data it could deliver to us. In our main study scheduled to take place in January and February 2020, we collaborate with Dynata a widely used online panel provider in economics research (de Quidt et al., 2018; Enke et al., 2019a). This provider will recruit samples of males who served in the military and who were assigned to a destination using the lottery.

¹The entry age was reduced to 19 in 1988.

Sample restrictions and sample size We restrict our main analysis to respondents who entered the lottery in 1990 or before and started the compulsory military service before in 1991 or before.² From our pilot we collected a sample of approximately 800 respondents meeting our sample restrictions, which we plan to use in the main study. In our full study we hope to collect data for at least an additional 3500 respondents who meet our inclusion criteria. We plan to pool observations from the pilot and the full study in our analysis to maximize statistical power.

We measure people's province at age 17, their year of birth, and the region of their military service twice throughout the survey. If they give us inconsistent responses to any of these questions, we will exclude them from the analysis. We will also exclude respondents whose father's occupation was in the military from the analysis as we are concerned that the personal connection to someone in the military could in principle undermine the lottery.

Power calculation We take the standard errors obtained in our pilot survey based on 800 observations in order to calculate minimum detectable effect sizes for a power of 80% for the key outcome measures of interest from our pilot under the assumption that we will collect an additional 3500 observations (such that we would have a total sample size of 4300). The minimum detectable effect size for a power of 80% for the main outcomes of interest for national identity, defined in Section 5.2, is 0.084 of a standard deviation. For a number of other outcome variables, we did not collect any pilot data and we are uncertain about the statistical power.

²To minimize any potential measurement error of people accidentally saying that they completed the mandatory military service, we ask all of our respondents whether the location of the instruction of their military service was determined by lottery. We exclude respondents who say that they did not enter the lottery. Based on our pilot data the fraction of people who say that they did not enter the lottery was quite small.

4 Survey

Background information We collect a basic set of demographics on cohort of birth, education, province of birth, province of residence at 17, income, and gender. We also gather information about a series of pre-determined covariates, namely the father’s and mother’s level of education, occupation, industry of work, and province of birth, the size of the municipality where the respondent grew up and the number of siblings. We also measure detailed background information on people’s military service, including whether they completed the mandatory service, in which provinces they completed the service, when they started the military service, and for how many months it lasted. We also measure the provinces their best friends from the military service are from, and people’s perceived exposure to people from other regions of Spain, and from different socio-economic backgrounds. To measure people’s regional mobility, we ask people about their current locality of residence, and elicit whether they ever lived outside of their region of birth. Subsequently, we ask our respondents for how many years they lived outside of their region of birth. We also measure when they first moved outside of their parents’ home and at what age they entered the labor market.

National versus regional identity We ask a series of qualitative questions to measure people’s identification with the nation Spain. For example, we ask our respondents whether they are proud to be Spanish, and how they feel when they see Spanish flag. Finally, following Enke et al. (2019b), we measure our respondents’ groupishness using a validated hypothetical question. We ask our respondents to split 100 Euros between a randomly chosen person from Spain and a randomly chosen person from their province of birth. Finally, we measure people’s feelings of sympathy vis a vis people of all 17 different regions of Spain using a qualitative response scale ranging from 0 to 10.

Beliefs Based on the experiments conducted by Cohn et al. (2019), we measure beliefs about the honesty of people from different cities in Spain. We provide our respondents

with the following instructions:

In a recent study, researchers tried to measure honesty of the inhabitants of several cities in the following way. The researchers dropped wallets in the streets of these cities and they measured the probability that the wallets would be returned to their owners. Each wallet contained 20 euros and a business card with the owner's email. What fraction of these wallets do you think were returned in each of the following cities?

We measure people's beliefs about the returned wallets in 17 different major cities in Spain, 11 of which were actually used in the study by Cohn et al. (2019). We elicit beliefs using a 5 point response scale ranging from (1) almost none (<20%) to (5) (Almost all (>80%)).³ Finally, we ask our respondents to assess cultural differences between people from their region of residence when aged 17 and people from all other regions in Spain.

Policy preferences We first measure people's perception of whether regional redistribution is too high, too low or about right. Then, we measure people's support for introducing a 1-month compulsory military service in Spain. We also elicit people's support for a scholarship program which provides Spanish students with the possibility of moving to a different region of Spain. Turning to more general political ideology, we examine people's self-placement on a conservative-liberal scale, their self-reported past voting behavior, their views on whether an Independence referendum for Catalonia should be considered, and their assessment of whether regional autonomy has rather positive effects or rather negative effects.

Personality We also measure a series of standard personality traits. First, we assess people's conscientiousness using one item from the 10-item big 5 personality scale. Then, we measure people's openness to new experiences using one item from the 10-item big 5 personality scale. Finally, we measure people's obedience to authorities in general.

³We chose to use a qualitative response scale with a quantitative meaning in order to reduce the cognitive burden for participants.

5 Definition of variables and families of outcomes

5.1 First-stage

We measure the first-stage using the following variables:

- **Any year outside:** This variable takes value one for respondents who spent at least one year outside of their province of birth.
- **Number friends in the military from other provinces:** This is a continuous variable on the number of friends people made during the military service that come from a province other than the province in which our respondent lived at age 17.
- **Number friends in the military, excluding province of origin and of the military service:** This is a continuous variable on the number of friends people made during the military service that come from a province other than the province in which our respondent lived at age 17 and other than the province of military service.
- **Exposure regions:** We measure exposure to people from other regions during the military service using a z-scored transformation of the following question: “To what extent did the military service allow you to meet people from other regions of Spain?” (ranging from (i) Very much to (iv) not at all). We code the variable such that higher values mean that people were more exposed to people from different regions of Spain.

To deal with multiple hypothesis testing, we will create a weighted index based on a z-scored transformation of these variables using the procedure proposed by Anderson (2008). We z-score each individual question using the mean and standard deviation of the sample.

Our hypothesis: We hypothesize that respondents who completed the military service outside of their province of residence at age 17 (i) are more likely to have lived in some

other province, (ii) made more friends during the military service from a province other than the province in which our respondent lived at age 17, (iii) made more friends during the military service that come from a province other than the province in which our respondent lived at age 17 and the province of military service (iv) were more exposed to people from other regions during the military service. We estimate specification 1 in Section 6 to test these hypotheses.

5.2 Primary outcomes

National identity

Our first family of outcomes measures our respondents' sense of national identity. It is based on the following variables:

- **Nation sentiment:** We measure national sentiment using a z-scored transformation of the following question: "Which of the following statements best describes your feelings?" (answers ranging from (i) I feel only Spanish to (v) I feel only attached to my local region). We reverse code the variable such that higher values mean that respondents feel more Spanish.
- **Proud Spanish:** We measure whether respondents are proud to be Spanish using a z-scored transformation of the following question: Are you proud to be Spanish? (answers ranging from (i) I feel very proud to be Spanish to (v) I am not at all proud to be Spanish). We reverse the scale such that higher values mean that respondents are more proud to be Spanish.
- **Sentiment flag:** We measure sentiment towards the flag using a z-scored transformation of the following question: How do you feel when you see the Spanish flag? (answers ranging from (i) I experience very positive emotions to (v) I experience very negative emotions. We reverse the scale such that higher values correspond to more positive feelings towards the Spanish flag.

To deal with multiple hypothesis testing, we will create a weighted index based on a z-scored transformation of these variables using the procedure proposed by Anderson (2008). We z-score each individual question using the mean and standard deviation of the sample.

Our hypothesis: We examine whether respondents who completed the military service outside of their province of residence when aged 17 (i) feel more Spanish, (ii) are more proud of Spain, (iii) experience more positive emotions when seeing the Spanish flag. To do so, we estimate specification 1 in Section 6.

Groupishness

Our second family of outcomes measures our respondents' universalism, their sympathy towards other regions of Spain and perceived trustworthiness of people from different regions of Spain. It is based on the following variables:

- **Universalism:** Following a validated measurement tool on moral universalism developed by Enke et al. (2019b), we measure how people split 100 Euros between a randomly chosen person from Spain versus a randomly chosen person from the province where the respondent lived at age 17. We z-score the amount of money given to the randomly chosen person from Spain, i.e. higher values indicate more moral universalism and less groupishness.
- **Sympathy:** We measure our respondent's sympathy towards inhabitants from other regions of Spain. We do so by taking the average sympathy towards all regions of Spain except for the own region of residence when aged 17. We code the variable such that higher values correspond to higher levels of sympathy towards people from other regions of Spain.
- **Perceived similarity:** We measure perceived similarity using a z-scored transformation of the following question: "In terms of personality, how large would you say

are the differences between people from the region where you lived at age 17 and people from other regions of Spain? (ranging from 0 “no differences at all” to 10 “the differences are large”). We code the variable such that higher values correspond to higher perceived similarity.

- **Perceived trustworthiness:** We measure our respondents’ beliefs about the fraction of dropped wallets returned across 17 cities from all different regions of Spain. To calculate the average perceived trustworthiness of people of other regions of Spain, we take the average beliefs except for beliefs about the returned wallet from the city in the respondent’s region of residence when aged 17. We code the variable such that higher values correspond to higher perceived trustworthiness.

To deal with multiple hypothesis testing, we will create a weighted index based on a z-scored transformation of these variables using the procedure proposed by Anderson (2008). We z-score each individual question using the mean and standard deviation of the sample.

Our hypothesis: We examine whether respondents who completed the military service outside of their province of residence when aged 17 (i) allocate relatively more money to people from Spain compared to people from the region of residence when aged 17 (ii) display more feelings of sympathy rather than antipathy vis a vis people from different regions of Spain (iii) perceive people from other regions of Spain as more similar and (iv) think that people of other regions of Spain are more trustworthy. To do so, we estimate specification 1 in Section 6.

Region-specific effects

Our third family of outcomes measures feelings and beliefs vis a vis the region where our respondent completed the military service using the following outcomes:

- **Sympathy:** Sympathy towards inhabitants of region of military service. We code the variable such that higher values correspond to higher feelings of sympathy.

- **Trustworthiness:** Beliefs about the trustworthiness of inhabitants of region of military service. We code the variable such that higher values correspond to higher perceived trustworthiness.

To deal with multiple hypothesis testing, we will create an unweighted index based on a z-scored transformation of these variables. We z-score each individual question using the mean and standard deviation of the sample.

Our hypothesis: We examine whether respondents who completed the military service in a region, r , (i) develop more feelings of sympathy towards region r , and (ii) consider people from region r as more trustworthy. To do so, we estimate specification 3 in Section 6. We provide additional details on how the variables are defined and how the analysis is conducted when discussing the empirical specification in Section 6.

5.3 Secondary outcomes

Political Preferences

We also shed light on how geographic mobility affected political preferences.

- **Support for educational mobility programs:** We measure support for a scholarship program that enables students with monetary support to move to a university in a different region in Spain. The variable is z-scored and coded such that higher values indicate higher support for the program.
- **Support for regional redistribution:** We measure support for regional redistribution using a z-scored transformation of following question: “Do you think redistribution from richer to poorer regions is too high, adequate or too low?” (answer categories are: (i) too high (ii) adequate (iii) too low). We code the variable such that higher values correspond to more support for regional redistribution.
- **Turnout:** We create a dummy for whether respondents turned out to the last general election in November 2019.

- **Voting behavior:** We create dummies for the different parties
- **Political ideology:** We measure respondents' political ideology using a 10-point scale ranging from (1) very left-wing to (10) very right-wing. We recode the variable such that higher values correspond to respondents being more left-wing.
- **Beliefs about regional autonomy:** We measure beliefs about regional autonomy using a z-scored transformation of the answers to the following question: "Do you think that, in general, the creation and development of the autonomous regions has been a rather positive or rather negative fact for Spain?" The answer categories are (i) rather positive, (ii) neither positive nor negative, (iii) rather negative. We code the variable such that higher values correspond to more negative beliefs.
- **Favoring Catalanian Independence referendum:** We measure support for a self-determination referendum using the following question: "Do you think that the holding of a referendum of self-determination in Catalonia should be considered?" Our outcome variables of interest takes value 1 if respondents support the holding of the referendum.

Other mechanisms We also study perceived exposure to people from different socioeconomic backgrounds, migration choices, the age at which people moved out of their parents' place, self-assessed openness to experiences, and an evaluation of the military service to understand mechanisms.

- **Exposure different socioeconomic background:** We measure exposure during the military service to people from other regions using a z-scored transformation of the following question: "To what extent did the military service allow you to meet people of different socio-economic backgrounds?" (ranging from (i) Very much to (iv) not at all). We code the variable such that higher values mean that people were more exposed to people of different socio-economic backgrounds.

- **Years outside region of birth:** The variable is defined as the number of years living outside the region of birth.
- **Current location:** This variable takes value one for respondents who currently still live in the same province as at age 17.
- **Emancipation:** The variable is defined as the age at which the respondent moved out of the parent's home.
- **Openness:** We measure openness using a z-scored transformation of people's agreement with the following statement: "I see myself as open to new experiences". We code this variable such that higher values correspond to higher openness to experience.
- **Evaluation of military service experience:** We use a z-scored transformation of people's evaluation of the military service ranging from (i) very positive to (v) very negative. We code the variable such that higher values correspond to more positive experiences during the military service.

Finally, we will also explore our other outcome variables collected to better understand mechanisms.

5.4 Coding of controls

Controls for all specifications We include the following variables as controls in the regressions:

- We include dummies for the education level achieved.
- We include a continuous variable measuring the age when the respondent started the military service.
- We include a dummy for whether the respondent lived in the same province at age 17 as at birth.

- We include a dummy for whether the father completed at least secondary education.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother completed at least secondary education.
- We include a categorical variable for the size of the municipality where the respondent grew up.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother was born in the same municipality as the respondent.
- We include a dummy for whether the father was born in the same municipality as the respondent.
- We include a dummy for whether the father was active in the labor market when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother was active in the labor market when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the agricultural sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the industrial sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the service sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the construction sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother worked in the agricultural sector when our respondent was aged 17.

- We include a dummy for whether the mother worked in the service sector when our respondent was aged 17.

6 Empirical specifications

6.1 Balance test

We conduct a standard balance test using the following set of pre-determined characteristics.

- We include a dummy for whether the respondent completed at least secondary education.
- We include a continuous variable measuring the age when the respondent started the military service.
- We include a dummy for whether the respondent lived in the same province at age 17 as at birth.
- We include a dummy for whether the father completed at least secondary education.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother completed at least secondary education.
- We include a categorical variable for the size of the municipality where the respondent grew up.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother was born in the same municipality as the respondent.
- We include a dummy for whether the father was born in the same municipality as the respondent.
- We include a dummy for whether the father was active in the labor market when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother was active in the labor market when our respondent was aged 17.

- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the agricultural sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the industrial sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the service sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the father worked in the construction sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother worked in the agricultural sector when our respondent was aged 17.
- We include a dummy for whether the mother worked in the service sector when our respondent was aged 17.

In our table we display the mean of these variables for respondents who started the mandatory military service before or in 1991 (i) in their region of residence at age 17, and (ii) outside their region of residence at 17. For each covariate, we also display the p-value of the coefficient on an indicator for whether one completed the military service in the region of residence, conditional on cohort fixed effects as well as province of residence at age 17 fixed effects.⁴

We also regress an indicator for whether one completed the military service in the region of residence on all pre-determined characteristics, conditional on cohort fixed effects as well as province of residence at age 17 fixed effects. We then conduct a joint F-test testing for the joint significance of all covariates included in the balance test.

⁴As a robustness check, we will also include cohort \times province at age 17 fixed effects rather than separately controlling for cohort fixed effects and province at age 17 fixed effects.

6.2 Main specification: Geographic mobility

We examine how geographic mobility affects people's identity. For this purpose we use data on all conscripts in our survey who entered the lottery for the compulsory military service in the year 1990 or before, and thus started the military service in 1991 or before.⁵ We study how our outcomes of interest (e.g. beliefs, preferences and people's identity), y_{icp} , are affected by whether people were randomly assigned to complete the military service in their region of residence when aged 17, $\text{serveinregion}_{icp}$, which takes value 1 for respondents who were randomly assigned to complete the military service in their region of residence when aged 17, and zero otherwise. Our specification controls for cohort fixed effects, ϕ_c , and province of residence when aged 17 fixed effects, province17_p . On top of this, we include a vector of pre-determined control variables, X_{icp} , which are described in Section 5.4. Our main specification of interest is thus given as follows:

$$y_{icp} = \alpha_1 \text{serveinregion}_{icp} + \Pi X_{icp} + \phi_c + \text{province17}_p + \varepsilon_{icp} \quad (1)$$

Throughout our analysis we cluster standard errors at the cohort-province at age 17 level.

Robustness check As a robustness check we estimate the following specification:

$$y_{icp} = \alpha_1 \text{serveinregion}_{icp} + \Pi X_{icp} + \phi_c \times \text{province17}_p + \varepsilon_{icp} \quad (2)$$

In this specification we control for interactions of cohort fixed effects and province fixed effects. We expect to lose some statistical power in this specification as we include a very large number of fixed effects. Therefore, we expect standard errors to increase relative to

⁵In general, it was not possible to escape the military service, but anecdotal evidence exists, suggesting that a small fraction of conscripts managed to escape the mandatory military service by completing the social service. We do everything we can to account for non-compliance with the assignment, i.e. we ask our respondents who completed the social service, whether they had originally entered the lottery and in which province they were assigned to go. We will include all non-compliers in our analysis. From pilot data we know that the fraction of non-compliers to the assignment is extremely low.

the previous specification.

6.3 Main specification: Region-specific effects

For some outcome variables of interest we collected sentiments and beliefs vis a vis people from all 17 regions of Spain. We study whether being randomly assigned to a particular region in Spain changed people’s sentiments and their beliefs about people from that particular region. For example: for each individual we measure sentiments towards respondents from all 17 regions. We plan to investigate how individuals rate their sentiment towards the region they were randomly assigned to compared to regions that they were not randomly assigned to. To conduct this analysis, we first reshape the dataset, such that for every single individual we have 17 observations, e.g. their expressed sentiment vis a vis all 17 regions. Our specification of interest is given as follows:

$$\text{sentimentregion}_{ir} = \rho_i + \delta_r + \beta_1 \text{serveinregion}_{ir} + \text{region17}_r \times \delta_r + \varepsilon_{ir} \quad (3)$$

Our identification here exploits within-individual variation, i.e. we include individual level fixed effects, ρ_i . Moreover, we include question region-fixed effects, δ_r , to control for differences in how much people like different regions on average. Finally, we control for the fact that individuals from certain regions may have a preference for other regions, by including interactions between region of residence at age 17 fixed effects, region17_r , and question region-fixed effects, δ_r .

7 Multiple hypothesis testing

To account for multiple testing, we will use indexes for each for the three main primary set of outcomes: index of national identity, index of groupishness, and index of region-specific sentiment and beliefs. The analysis of secondary outcomes is exploratory and,

therefore, we do not plan to correct p-values for multiple testing in this case. This analysis will serve primarily as a way to investigate the potential mechanisms driving our main results and to suggest avenues for future research. This approach is common in medical trials, and has also been used by other pre-registered experimental studies in economics (Blattman et al., 2016).

References

- Anderson, Michael L**, “Multiple Inference and Gender Differences in the Effects of Early Intervention: A Reevaluation of the Abecedarian, Perry Preschool, and Early Training Projects,” *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 2008, 103 (484), 1481–1495.
- Blattman, Christopher, Donald Green, Daniel Ortega, and Santiago Tobón**, “Preanalysis plan for The impact of hotspot policing and municipal services on crime: experimental evidence for Bogotá,” 2016.
- Cohn, Alain, Michel André Maréchal, David Tannenbaum, and Christian Lukas Zünd**, “Civic honesty around the globe,” *Science*, 2019, p. eaau8712.
- Coppock, Alexander and Oliver A McClellan**, “Validating the demographic, political, psychological, and experimental results obtained from a new source of online survey respondents,” *Research & Politics*, 2019, 6 (1), 1–14.
- de Quidt, Jonathan, Johannes Haushofer, and Christopher Roth**, “Measuring and Bounding Experimenter Demand,” *American Economic Review*, 2018, 108 (11), 3266–3302.
- Enke, Benjamin, Ricardo Rodríguez-Padilla, and Florian Zimmermann**, “Moral Universalism and the Structure of Ideology,” 2019.
- , —, and —, “Moral universalism: Measurement and heterogeneity,” 2019.
- Wood, Thomas and Ethan Porter**, “The elusive backfire effect: Mass attitudes’ steadfast factual adherence,” *Political Behavior*, 2019, 41 (1), 135–163.

Appendix

Survey instructions

Basic demographics + military service background

Were you born in Spain? Yes No

What is your gender? Male Female Other

Did you complete the military service?

Obligatory military service (mili)

Voluntary military service (professional service)

No, I completed the social service

No, I was exempted

Other

Before you completed the social service, did you enter the lottery for the military service?
[only for respondents who responded “No, I completed the social service”]

Yes

No

Do you remember the destination drawn for you in the lottery? [only for respondents who responded “Yes” to the question whether they entered the lottery before doing the social service] dropdown list with 52 provinces + the option I do not remember.

Usually, the destination where recruits complete the obligatory military service was decided by means of a lottery. In your personal case, was your location determined by the lottery? [only for respondents who responded “Obligatory military service (mili)”]

Yes

No

Why were you exempted? [only for respondents who responded “No, I was exempted”]

Quota surplus (by lottery)

I enjoyed extensions until the obligation to perform mandatory military service expired

Other

Normally, surplus quotas were decided by means of a lottery. In your personal case, was your quota surplus determined by a lottery? [only for respondents who chose "Quota surplus (by lottery)"]

Yes

No

In what year did you enter the lottery for the military service? [only for respondents who entered the lottery]

Basic demographics: Location

In what year were you born?

In which province were you born?

Did you live in this province until you were aged 17? (Yes, No I moved when I was 1 year old, No I moved when I was 2 years old, ..., No I moved when I was 17 years old).

In which province did you live when you were aged 17?

In which province do you currently live?

Basic demographics: education and income

What is your highest level of education?

No studies

Primary school

Middle school/Junior high school

Vocational training first grade

Vocational training second grade

Secondary school
Technical university
University degree
Doctorate degree

Which of the following best describes your employment status?

Full-time worker (more than 30 hours a week)
Part-time worker
Self-employed
Retired
Home-maker
Mother/father in charge of children
Student
Unemployed
Disabled
None of the above

Currently, how much income do you have on average per month, after the tax deduction (that is, net income)?

No income at all
Less than 300 Euros
Between 300 and 600 Euros
Between 600 and 900 Euros
Between 900 and 1200 Euros
Between 1200 and 1800 Euros
Between 1800 and 2400 Euros
Between 2400 and 3000 Euros
Between 3000 and 4500 Euros
Between 4500 and 6000 Euros
More than 6000 Euros

Basic demographics: pre-determined characteristics

What is the highest level of education of your father?

What is the highest level of education of your mother?

What was your father's occupation when you were aged 17?

What was your mother's occupation when you were aged 17?

In what industry did your father's employer when you were aged 17 operate?

In what industry did your mother's employer when you were aged 17 operate?

In which province was your father born?

In which province was your mother born?

How many siblings do you have? (please also include siblings that have passed away)

What is the population size of the municipality in which you grew up?

Military service: for people who completed the service

When did you start your military service? (year, month) [drop-down list]

How many months did your military service last? [drop-down list]

In which province did you complete the first three months (i.e. the instructions) of your military service? [drop-down list]

In which provinces did you complete the remaining time of your military service? [drop-down list]

Which unit of the military were you a part of? [drop-down list]

Military service experience

What is your assessment of your experience in military service?

It was a very positive experience

It was a positive experience

Neutral

It was a negative experience

It was a very negative experience

To what extent did the military service allow you to meet people from other regions of Spain?

Very much

Somewhat

Little

Not at all

To what extent did the military service allow you to meet people of different socio-economic backgrounds?

Very much

Somewhat

Little

Not at all

Think now about the friends you had during the military service. What province(s) were your friends from?

Migration history

Throughout your life, did you ever live outside your region of birth? (please include the period of the obligatory military service, if applicable)?

Throughout your life, for how many years did you live outside your region of birth? (please include the period of military service, if applicable)?

At which age did you stop living with your parents permanently to move to live on your own? [drop-down list]

At which age did you start working? [drop-down list]

National versus regional identity

Which of the following statements best describes your feelings?

I feel only Spanish.

I feel more attached to Spain than I feel attached to my local region.

I feel equally attached to Spain as to my local region.

I feel more attached to my local region than I feel attached to Spain.

I feel only attached to my local region

Are you proud to be Spanish?

I feel very proud to be Spanish

I feel somewhat proud to be Spanish

I am not very proud to be Spanish

I am not at all proud to be Spanish

How do you feel when you see the Spanish flag?

I experience very positive emotions

I experience somewhat positive emotions

I experience no emotions

I experience somewhat negative emotions

I experience very negative emotions

Universalism

Imagine that you had to split 100 Euros between two other people, Person A and Person B. Person A is a randomly chosen person from Spain, while Person B is a randomly chosen person from the region you lived at age 17. How much money would you like to give to Person B and how much money would you like to give to Person A?

Person A (randomly chosen person from Spain):

Person B (randomly chosen person from the region you lived at age 17):

Beliefs about trustworthiness: Wallet drop

In a recent study, researchers tried to measure honesty of the inhabitants of several cities in the following way. The researchers dropped 100 wallets in the streets of these cities and they measured the probability that the wallets would be returned to their owners. Each wallet contained 20 euros and a business card with the owner's email. How many of these wallets do you think were returned in each of the following cities? (Almost all (>80%), the majority (60%-80%), approximately half (40% - 60%), less than half (40% -20%), almost none (<20%).

A Coruna:

Albacete:

Barcelona:

Bilbao:

Cáceres:

Gijon:

Las Palmas de Gran Canaria:

Logroño:

Madrid:

Murcia:

Palma de Mallorca:

Pamplona:

Santander:

Sevilla:

Valencia:

Valladolid:

Zaragoza:

Personality

To what extent do you agree with the following statements:

I see myself as self-disciplined

I see myself as open to new experiences

It is important to obey to authorities

(strongly disagree, disagree, neither agree nor disagree, agree, strongly agree)

Sympathy

What are your feelings of sympathy or antipathy towards the inhabitants of the following regions? To assess it, use a scale from 0 to 10, taking into account that 0 means that “you like them not at all”, 5 means that “you are indifferent” and 10 means that “you like them very much”.

Andaluces

Aragoneses

Asturianos

Baleares

Canarios

Cántabros

Castellano leoneses

Castellano manchegos

Catalanes

Extremeños

Gallegos

Madrileños

Murciananos

Navarros

Riojanos

Valencianos

Vascos

Belief about cultural differences across Spain

In terms of personality, how large would you say are the differences between inhabitants of the region where you lived in at age 17 compared to inhabitants of other regions of Spain? 0 means that there are no differences at all, while 10 means that the differences are large.

Policy preferences

Some regions in Spain are wealthier than other regions. Do you think redistribution from richer to poorer regions is too high, adequate or too low?

Too high

Adequate

Too low

The French government has announced the introduction of a mandatory national universal service (SNU) of one month for all French youths of both sexes of 16 years. This service will offer young people “a citizen experience of military life, social mix and cohesion” and it is estimated that it will cost around 1.6 billion Euro. Would you agree with the introduction of a similar universal national service in Spain?

Strongly agree

Somewhat agree

Neither agree nor disagree

Somewhat disagree

Strongly disagree

The Seneca Scholarships (also known as the National Erasmus) allow Spanish university students to study at a Spanish university institution other than the one in which the student is enrolled. This typically allows students to move to a different region of Spain for a period of time. The amount of these scholarships amounts to 500 euros per month. In 2020 these scholarships will have a total budget of 2 million euros Do you think the budget for this program should be much higher / higher / equal / lower / much lower?

Much higher

Higher

Equal

Lower

Much lower

Political preferences

Do you think that, in general, the creation and development of the autonomous regions has been a rather positive or rather negative fact for Spain?

Rather positive

Neither positive nor negative

Rather negative

Do you think that the holding of a referendum of self-determination in Catalonia could be considered?

Yes

No

I don't know

How would you rate your political leanings on a scale from 0 to 10, where 0 means that you are very left-wing and 10 means that you are very right-wing?

Did you vote in the general elections which took place on November 10th, 2019? Yes No

Which party did you vote for in the general elections which took place on November 10th, 2019?

PSOE

PP

Vox

Ciudadanos

Unidas Podemos

ERC-Sobiranistes

EAJ/PNV

JxCAT

Other

Prefer not to say

Additional demographics

Could you confirm the province in which you lived at age 17.

Could you confirm the province in which you completed the instruction of your military service.

We would now like to confirm your date of birth. What is your date of birth? (year, month, day)